

בעזרה"ת

ERUVIN IN BROOKLYN

Subject of erubin in Brooklyn, has been a matter for discussion since the first eruv was constructed there in the year 5739, by rabbonom of the community of Flatbush. Before constructing this eruv, they asked the great sage of the previous generation Reb Moshe Feinstein, of blessed memory.

He replied: books of the Shulchan Aurach (Code of Jewish Laws) are open for all to study. However, he personally, does not want to get involved in their project. His answer, was later published in his work Igros Moshe(part 4 letter number 87).

When one studies these laws, he sees clearly: an area surrounded by walls, is a private domain according to the Torah. Brooklyn is surrounded by walls on all sides. Therefore, it is a private domain.

Even if there are some breaks in these walls, it is still a private domain, according to the Torah. Because, we rule, an area surrounded by two walls, and a small part of a third wall, is a private domain. More, so, an area surrounded by four walls, like Brooklyn, is a private domain. Even if there are some breaks in these walls.

In an area that is a private domain, according to Torah law, an eruv can be constructed. No one disagrees with this.

Reb Moshe Feinstein, of blessed memory, in afore mentioned letter, explains why he does not want to get involved in their plan. However, he states clearly, his reasons for not embracing their project was not accepted by leading sages of previous generations. Therefore, it is not a clear-cut ruling.

In a letter, published in Igros Moshe, after the afore mentioned letter (letter number 88). He states clearly: his ruling is against the ruling of the Shulchan Aurach. He also states clearly: one can rely on the ruling of the Shulchan Aurach.

These are undisputable facts. Stated openly in Igros Moshe.

They are obvious to any one learning this subject. Even if they were not stated openly in Igros Moshe. However, the author of Igros Moshe, stated these facts clearly, so that those learning his work will not get confused, and his ruling will not be distorted, misrepresented, garbled, or prevaricated.

Nevertheless, just the opposite happened. Lies were spread. Stating: his ruling is absolute and impeccable.

Obviously an equivocate. Anyone who studies this subject sees this clearly: and, just the opposite is stated clearly in Igros Moshe.

Therefore, the public must be aware. Any publicity stating the opposite of what is stated in letters published in Igros Moshe is a lie. Publicized by individuals trying to dupe, and bamboozle the public.

However, the public cannot be fooled. Eruvin have existed in Brooklyn for more than twenty years. They will continue to exist. In spite of those who want to fool the public.

LEARNING TORAH

When learning Torah, one aims to find the truth. Personalities don't count. For example, when the Rambam, or other Rishonim argue with Rashi, one does not go into a discussion about who is greater. When Achronim, sometimes, argue with Rishonim, we also do not go into a discussion about who is greater. Because, every one agrees, Rishonim were greater.

One learns a subject. Tries to understand it: and, comes to a conclusion.

One cannot pursue a method of learning saying: Rashi is greater than Tosfos, he is sure to be correct, so why learn Tosfos. Such a person does not pursue proper methods of learning Torah: and, does not know how to learn.

This is my opinion of all those who state: Reb Moshe's ruling on a matter of Jewish Law is absolute: and cannot be disputed. Because, Reb Moshe is an Achron.

Therefore, his opinion on any matter of Jewish Law cannot be considered more valid than views of other Achronim. His opinion cannot be more reliable than those of the Reshonim.

All his rulings on matters of Jewish Law must be studied in this perspective. Not doing this is a complete misconception of the process one must go through when learning Torah.

I wrote to every Rov that signed on the decree, in the year 5739, to prohibit making an eruv in Brooklyn. Asking them to explain their reason for this ban. No one answered except Rabbi Moshe Bick.

I am not the greatest Torah scholar living in this generation. However, I am not crazy.

I studied a subject: asked normal questions that anyone who studied this subject would ask: and did not get an answer from anyone involved.

The basic question is: how can you proclaim, it is forbidden to make an eruv in Brooklyn, when the Shulchan Aurach, and all leading poskim permit it. This is a simple logical question that deserves an answer.