

Eruvin In Large Cities

In the year 5667 an eruv was established in Manhattan, approved of by five leading Torah scholars, in the generation. Reasons for their ruling was published when this eruv was established. No one has ever refuted their ruling (ספר עירוב והוצאה--שו"ת תירוש ויצהר ס' עג)

They ruled, bodies of water surrounding Manhattan, are like a wall surrounding it. These bodies of water, there since creation, have never dried up, and will never dry up, and are reliable walls for Manhattan.

In the year 5660, Rav Malkeal Tanenbaum, of blessed memory, holy Rabbi of Lomza, Poland, in a letter written to Rabbonim in Odessa, Russia, concerning the eruv there, ruled that bodies of water are like walls. Therefore he ruled, Odessa, which is on the Black Sea, has a valid wall on that side, according to Jewish Law. He further stated: this ruling cannot be disputed. Because, many Holy sages, from past generations, ruled: bodies of water are like a wall around a city. Common custom, for many generations, has been to rely on bodies of water in many large cities. שו"ת דברי מלביאל.

Ten of the leading Torah scholars of that generation, ruled in favor of the eruv in Odessa, and stated in letters written to Rabbonim of Odessa that the Black Sea is a valid boundary. These letters were published for all to see and never refuted.

(ספר היקוץ שבט)

Holy Grand Rabbi of Toronto Canada, Rav Graubart, of blessed memory, author of monumental work on Jewish Law, approved of by leading Torah scholars, established an eruv there. He stated the bodies of water surrounding Toronto were walls surrounding this city. His ruling, published, and approved of by leading Torah scholars in his generation, was never refuted.

We see from rulings by holy Torah scholar of past generations that bodies of water surrounding a city are like walls. This is not a matter to be discussed or refuted. Because, it has been common custom, in many large cities for hundreds of years to rely on this ruling.