

Dear Shmuel:

Saw your posts on the internet on "Avodah" where you discuss difference between eruv in Queens, Reb Moshe approved of, and eruv in Brooklyn he didn't approve of. (For interesting posts on eruv in Flatbush see website: "Flatbush eruv Shiah Director")

Many times I discussed this with Rav Menasha Klein. Who you, and other pro-eruv people, fail to quote in many writings. Even, though, he was the first to print a booklet stating lucid, undisputable reasons, for establishing eruvin in Brooklyn. We are aware of letter printed in Igros Moshe, posthumously, in part 8, never written by him. Answer to this letter printed in Misnah Halocos (part 8) shows stupidity of this letter. Undersigned, also wrote a booklet proving it's a complete forgery. Not uncommon for anti-eruv people. They always print forgeries and lie.

Rabbi Klein replied. Reb Moshe's letters on this subject don't make sense. He contradicts himself from one letter to the other. Because, Brooklyn and Queens are connected. It's completely illogical to permit an eruv in Queens and not in Brooklyn.

However, the fact is, he never was against eruvin in Brooklyn. See website: "Flatbush eruv Shiah Director" where this is clearly explained. I spoke to Moshe Steinberg. He told me, he spoke with Rabbi Bomzer, he said Reb Moshe told him openly, he should make an eruv in Flatbush. Rabbi Sharfman told me the same thing. He also told this to Rav Menasah Klein. He published, and distributed, through the mail, 5,000 copies of his booklet stating this, in 1981.

However, people don't read books. They read posters, and advertizments in newspapers, wherein anti-eruv people lie, and proclaim an issuer, in name of Reb Moshe.

Reason Reb Moshe didn't write an outright permission to make eruvin in Beoklyn, in his many letters about eruvin, he only told people to make eruvin, was to protect honor of Agudas Harabbonim. Who proclaimed an issuer against making eruvin in all cities where 600,000 people live. (Which is laughed at.

Because, there are eruvim in many large cities in the United States.) Had he written in Igros Moshe, open permission to make an eruv, it would have been a slap in the face for Agudas Harabbonim. He didn't want to publicly shame them. However, when one reads between the lines of his many letters, he sees one can make an eruv in Brooklyn. In letter 88 ibid., he says this openly: however, people don't read what he writes. Even if they have his letter in front of them.

Pro-eruv people also don't read what he, and others, write. Published in Kensington eruv booklet, published in 5764, is a letter, stating no one has clearly explained reasons for permitting eruvim in Brooklyn.

Reasons for permitting eruvim in Brooklyn, were explained clearly in Sefer Eruv Vhotzah, printed in 1908. Even though it was written about Manhattan. Same reasons apply to Brooklyn. They ruled rivers surrounding Manhattan are walls. Same is true of Brooklyn surrounded by rivers on more than three sides. Rabbi Klein clearly explained reasons for permitting eruvim in Brooklyn. Reb Moshe Feinstein ibid. states one can make an eruv in Brooklyn and follow ruling of Shulchan Aurach.

Rabbi Sharfman told me. Many times he went to Reb Moshe and asked him for a letter, stating he can make an eruv, like he told him, so he can show it to anti-eruv people, and others in Flatbush. He refused.

Reb Itzein Feinstein told him. The Rov would give you a letter. But, Rav Elberg, from Agudas Harabbonim, will come every day and bother the Rov for two hours, asking him to retract what he wrote.

Reb Moshe agreed one can make an eruv in all of Brooklyn. However, he was under pressure from Agudas Harabbonim, and other anti-eruv people. So he just told this to people who asked him.

Hope all is well,

*Shlomo*