

Kislev 14 5766

Dear Shmuel:

Saw your posts on the internet, on website "Avodah", were you discuss difference between Queens Eruv, Reb Mosha approved of (Igros Mosha 4:86), and Flatbush Eruv he didn't approve of. (For many interesting posts about the Flatbush Eruv see website: "Flatbush Eruv Shiah Director".)

Many times I discussed this with Rav Menasha Klein. He said, Reb Moshes letters on this subject don't make sense. He contradicts himself from one letter to the other. Because, Queens and Brooklyn are connected. It's completely illogical to permit an eruv in Queens and not in Brooklyn.

However, fact is, he was never against eruv in Brooklyn. See website: "Flatbush Eruv Shiah Director", where this is clearly explained. Make sure to read carefully all posts, and comments, by Shiah Director.

Rabbi Bomzer, a Rov in Flatbush, said Reb Moshe told him openly, he should make an eruv in Flatbush. Rabbi Sharfman, (referred to *ibid.* 87) Rov of Young Israel of Flatbush, in 1979, when an eruv was made there, told me the same thing.

He also told Rav Menasha Klein to make an eruv in Boro Park. In 1981, he published a 46 page booklet, explaining non refutable, clear cut reasons for making an eruv in Brooklyn. No one in the past 25 years, has published anything equal to this masterpiece of Jewish scholarship. Therein, he quotes conversation he had with Reb Mosha, about making an eruv in Boro Park. 5,000 copies were distributed via mail.

However, people don't read booklets. They read posters in the street, fliers, and, advertisements in newspapers, by anti-eruv people. **Who lie, and proclaim an issuer, in name of Reb Moshe.**

Reason Reb Moshe didn't write, in his many letters about eruv in Brooklyn, outright permission to make eruv in Brooklyn, was to protect honor of Agudas Harabbonim. Who in 1979, proclaimed an issuer against making eruv in large cities, where 600,000 people live. (Which is laughed at. Because there are eruv in more than 100 cities in the United States and Canada. Many of these cities have more than 600,000 people.)

Had he written open permission to make an eruv in Brooklyn, like he told afore mentioned rabbonim, and more people, it would have been a slap in the face for Agudas Harabbonim. He didn't want to publicly shame them.

However, when one reads between the lines of his many letters about eruv in Brooklyn, published in Igros Moshe (*ibid.*), he saw and reviewed when he was alive, he sees clearly, Reb Moshe was not against eruv in Brooklyn.

However, people don't read, and analyze carefully what he wrote. Even if they have his letters in front of them. Most of the general public don't know these letters exist. They are blinded by lies spread by anti-eruv people: and, think it's the word of GOD.

## Part 2

There was an eruv in Manhattan, in 1908, approved of by seven leading Torah scholars of their generation. They ruled rivers around Manhattan are walls around it. Same ruling applies to Brooklyn.

Their written, super genius, discussions. Were published, for all Torah scholars to learn, in Sefer Eruv Vhotzah, published in 1908: and, republished in 1979.

Rav Malkiel Tanenbaum, holy Rov of Lomza, Poland, author of monumental work Divrei Malkiel, in a letter written to Rabbonim of Odessa, Russia, in 1900, about the eruv there. States: the Black Sea, which is on one side of Odessa, is a wall. He further states: this is not a matter for discussion. Because, Rabbonim in many cities, for hundreds of years, have ruled, oceans and rivers are walls. Ten leading scholars in that generation, in letters printed in Sefer Tikun Shabbos, about the eruv in Odessa, ruled: the Black Sea is a wall for city of Odessa. Sefer Tikun Shabbos was republished in 1980.

## Part 3

Rabbi Sharfman told me. Many times he went to Reb Moshe to ask him for a letter saying he can make an eruv in Flatbush. Like he told him. So he can show it to anti-eruv people and others. He refused.

He said, Rebitzen Feinstein told him. The Rov would give you a letter. But, Rav Elberg, from Agudas Harabbonim, will come every day, and, bother the Rov for two hours, asking him to retract what he wrote.

Reb Mosha agreed one can make an eruv in Brooklyn: and, told this to anyone who asked him. His many lengthy letters in Igros Moshe, ruling against the Shulchan Aurach, and all poskim, were reserved for Torah scholars: and, only explain reasons to be machmer as stated there openly. This was not his pesak din for the public.

However, he was under pressure from Agudas Harabbonim, and other anti-eruv people. Therefore, he only told this to people who asked him. His obligation according to Torah Law. But, he was not obligated to put this in writing.

Hope all is well,

Shmali

387